Market Issues

Observations and Opinions

Foundational Detail

- ► Facts: Three general types of electric markets in US48
 - Some states have required divestiture of generating assets in their zeal to push one design option electric marketplace evolution
 - Some states have accommodated marketplace evolution while retaining the vertical integration model
 - ▶ Some states still operate with old bilateral-only market designs "Non-Market" areas
- Caution opinions ahead!
 - Security-constrained economic dispatch works in either sort of market and makes more efficient use of transmission and generation assets than the Non-Market areas
 - State vs. Federal regulatory tensions have contributed to poor outcomes in the wholesale marketplace
 - Lurching evolution
 - Capacity markets/"Missing money"
 - Inconsistent reliability criteria for resource adequacy/"Counting"
 - ▶ Lack of consensus on cost allocation for regional transmission investment

Regional Market Design Role Definition and Governance

-Drawn in stark terms for heuristic purposes

- Key aspect of role definition: <u>fiduciary responsibility</u>
 - ▶ E.g. "Low rates" **VS.** "Reliable and Workably Competitive"
- Key aspect of governance: board selection
 - Voters elect a politician who appoints agents who set the course of the organization; VS.
 - Independent search identifies qualified-by-experience, non-conflicted slate of candidates who are elected by participating stakeholders/ballot sectors
- Key aspect of process: <u>stakeholder engagement</u>
 - Need to mercifully reduce the frequency and number of stakeholder forums and improve virtual access and participation through technology

Regional Market Design Evolution

- Is the EIM an experiment?
 - ▶ It has demonstrated efficiency benefits through pooled dispatch
 - ▶ It has improved situational awareness and response through coordination
- At what point does a regional structure deliver additional benefits?
 - Expanded unit commitment coordination is one aspect of the day-ahead process
 - Consolidation of balkanized roles?
 - Transmission tariff
 - Interconnection queue
 - ► Ancillary services (contingency reserves and G/L balance)
 - Resource adequacy and reserve margin counting criteria
 - Regional transmission planning process